

Promoting the Emergence of EFL Students' Fundamental Critical Thinking Skills through English Debate: A Case Study in Indonesian Context

by Nia 12 Kurniawati

Submission date: 07-Jun-2023 12:53PM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 2110828559

File name: ternational_8_PROMOTINGTHEEMERGENCEOFEFLSTUDENTSCT-IKHSAN_1.pdf (3.06M)

Word count: 129

Character count: 732

See discussions, stats, and author profiles for this publication at: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/340062556>

Promoting the Emergence of EFL Students' Fundamental Critical Thinking Skills through English Debate: A Case Study in Indonesian Context

Conference Paper · March 2018

CITATIONS
0

READS
11

3 authors:



Muhamad Ikhsan Pratama
UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung
1 PUBLICATION 0 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE



Dahlya Indra Nurwanti
UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung
7 PUBLICATIONS 9 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE



Nia Kurniawati
UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung
11 PUBLICATIONS 7 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE

Some of the authors of this publication are also working on these related projects:

 Article View project

PROMOTING THE EMERGENCE OF EFL STUDENTS' FUNDAMENTAL CRITICAL THINKING SKILLS THROUGH ENGLISH DEBATE A CASE STUDY IN INDONESIAN CONTEXT

Muhamad Ikhsan Pratama, Nia Kurniawati and Dahlya Indra Nurwanti

¹ Faculty of Tarbiyah and Teacher Training, UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Jalan A. H. Nasution no. 105 Cibiru,
Bandung, Indonesia

Muhikprat@gmail.com, niakurniawati29_jtk@uinsgd.ac.id, dahlyamurwanti@uinsgd.ac.id

Keywords: Critical Thinking; Critical Pedagogy; Debate; Language Proficiency; Indonesian EFL students

Abstract: Critical thinking (CT) is considered to be one of the important skills that should be mastered by college students. CT is closely related to thinking process used to deliver ideas and making decisions that become parts of a requirement for college students. However, teaching the students to possess CT skills takes times. Therefore, the campus activities need to be directed to equip the students with this CT skills. In Indonesian context, the use of "Debate Activity" to be a part of college students' activities is considered one way to train the students CT skills. This study aims at evaluating the emergence of CT skills in debating activities conducted by EFL learners. The fundamental CT skills proposed by Fisher (2001) were utilized. To achieve this goal, four participants are selected purposively by considering the result from their recorded video of the speech and their notes that they made in case building section. The instruments use to collect the data are document analysis and recorded video. The result shows six from nine kinds of fundamental CT can be covered by EFL students' in English debates. They are (1) reasons and conclusions, (2) clarify and interpret expressions and ideas, (3) evaluate arguments of different kinds, (4) produce explanations, (5) draw inferences, and (6) produce arguments. This study contributes to provide the new perspective that debate has potential to foster the students' Critical Thinking. However, To face the challenge, the students need to be provided more activities like a debate in and out of the class.

1 INTRODUCTION

Recent research conducted by Educational Testing Service (Liu, Frankel, & Roohr, 2014) that interviews more than 200 institutions provost regarding the most commonly measured general education skills reveals that critical thinking is one of the most important skills considered for both academic and career success. Moreover, Critical Thinking is one of the important skills students 21st need (Willingham, 2007). It makes Critical Thinking a crucial skill to be taught and mastered by students. In Indonesia, the importance of critical thinking is strengthened by the Indonesian government regulation No. 20/2003 on the National Education System. The regulation aims at creating qualified education to face the competitive global world needs. Meanwhile, in creating qualified education, Critical Thinking is seen as one of the skills that should be acquired (Junining, 2016).

A number of research regarding debate activity and CT had been conducted. At least four researches are found regarding the effect of debate on English students' CT skills. The first is the study from Goodwin (2003) who focuses on the students' perception on debate as a teaching technique. There

are two highlights of the result of this study. First, some students report that debating technique is uncomfortable or unfamiliar. On the other hand, most students express that debate is very helpful to help them master content or gain knowledge through analyzing arguments. They realize that debate requires them to be open-minded to different kinds of opinions and it improves their CT skills.

The second is the study from Oros (2007) who analyzes the Structured Classroom Debates (SCDs) in political science course. It is stated in this research that to develop classroom participation and generating discussion over a range of points of view, debate is considered to be the effective method. It is then indicated that debates tend to increase students' value placed on course readings and assignments when compared to course where debates are not used.

The third is the study from Rashtchi & Sadraeimanesh (2011) who investigate the impact of debate as a critical thinking strategy on reading comprehension ability as well as critical thinking of Iranian EFL learners. The study found that debate made a significantly different performance of the students in the control and experimental groups. It is concluded then that debate is a great strategy to

improve the participants' reading comprehension and critical thinking.

The fourth is the study from Danaye Tous, Tahriri, & Haghighi (2015) about the effect of debate instruction on male and female EFL learners' reading comprehension and their perception through Critical thinking (CT) instruction. The result reveals that debate had a significant effect on the students' reading comprehension regardless of the participants' gender.

From the above description, all four researches focus on the significances of debate as a teaching technique in fostering CT and improving students' English skills. This study is different from the previous study. Meanwhile, this study aims at evaluating the emergence of CT skills in debating activities conducted by EFL learners. It does not examine whether or not debate could promote CT skills or how the learners perceive it as a teaching technique. Otherwise, it focuses on, if any, the kinds of CT skills emerging in the debates. The study focuses on fundamental critical thinking skills proposed by Fisher (2001) shown in the EFL students English debates. Specifically, this present study is intended to analyze what kinds of fundamental CT skills emerge in English debates that can be covered by EFL students. It is expected that the result of the research provides useful and reliable data and information about the kind of fundamentals of CT that can be covered by EFL students on their debate activity as well as the debate activity role to promote the emergence of EFL students fundamental CT skills in order to train learners to be critical thinkers.

2 LITERATURE REVIEW

Critical Thinking

Experts have define Critical Chinking in several ways. Butler (2012) cited in Chen (2017) considers Critical Thinking as one of the mostly-discussed skills. He defines Critical Thinking as making reasoned judgments to focus on deciding what to believe or do. The "Reasoned" is produced by considering logical thinking process, while "Judging" consists of determining the degree to which a thing meets a standard, a rule, or other criteria (Beyer, 1995; Facione & others, 2011; Norris & Ennis, 1989; Stapleton, 2001). It involves logical thinking, decision making, and problem-solving process (Butler, 2012; Halpern, 2003).

This study is utilized the fundamental CT skills proposed by Fisher (2001). The nine fundamental critical thinking skills are focused on the students' skill to: (a) identify the elements in a reasoned case, especially reasons and conclusions, (b) identify and evaluate assumptions, (c) clarify and interpret expressions and ideas, (d) judge the acceptability, especially the credibility of claims, (e) evaluate arguments of different kinds, (f) analyze, evaluate

and produce explanations, (g) analyze, evaluate make decisions, (h) draw inferences, and (i) pro arguments.

Debate

Krieger (2007) states that debate is an argument form that examines what is or is not the case or rhetoric which is the technique of persuasion. In a debate, there must be two sides: affirmative and negative. Each team consists of three speakers that identified by their speaker number and their team side. For instance, 'first affirmative' (the first affirmative team speaker), 'third negative' (the third negative team speaker), and so on (Quinn, 2005).

CT and Debate

Critical thinking has a relation with the debate. Teaching CT through debate allows for collaboration where teams can achieve higher levels of thinking through the use of persuasive evidence (Freeley & Steinberg, 2005). Rather than lecturing, students learn more advanced by actively analyzing, discussing, and applying content in meaningful ways (Bonwell & Eison, 1991).

Goodwin (2003) has investigated the students' perception toward debate. The study asks students to do teamwork in preparing debates on arising issues. The result of the study shows that most of the students reported that analyzing arguments on the debate was useful and helpful in gaining knowledge. It shows that debate increases their tolerance level on keeping an open mind. The same broad topic had been investigated by Danaye Tous, Tahriri, & Haghighi (2015). The result of the study shows debate is helpful in teaching CT (Freeley & Steinberg, 2005). Thus, CT is seen as the important skills and debate is a way to teach CT. Therefore, this study is concerned to the EFL students' critical thinking that emerges in English debates on arising issue.

3 METHOD

This study uses a qualitative approach which is specifically designed as a case study. This study took debate activity out class, specifically in an English debate competition. Specifically, this study was conducted to the EFL students who are participating in an Annual English Students Association National Debate Competition.

The participants of this research are four contestants. The participants are selected purposively during the event in the research site.

During the debate competition, the selected participants' statements are recorded and collected, especially when they are in the case building and presentation session. The recorded video and the noted is analyzed to seek out the kinds of fundamental CT skills emerges in English debate.

4 FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

The results show that six from nine fundamental CT skills emerged in English Debates. The results are obtained from video documentation and document analysis.

The first participant' shows six fundamental CT points. The points elaborated in Table 1:

Table 1: The First Participant' Emerging CT Skills

No.	Fundamental CT	Example
1	Reasons and Conclusions	And thereby human rights threaten local norms.
2	Clarify and Interpret expressions and ideas	For example, I would like to give example why human right threaten local norm, blasphemy law.
3	Evaluate arguments of different kinds	Blasphemy law in Ahok's case happens because there is no clarification about issue religion something wrong or not.
4	Produce explanations	This is the case from 2016, one year ago until now. And this is still not solve. This is because there is no clarification about issue religion something wrong or not.
5	Draw Inferences	The first of all I would like to give standardization so we can conclude the motion that are going to begin today.
6	Produce arguments	We have to know that every local places should have their own perception, belief, and rules, no matter it is threatened or not. Most of it, most of the thing that make human right threaten local norm is something that not threatened.

The data of the first participant' are taken from the recorded video along debate battle. The recorded video is transcribed in order to make it easier to analyze. The motion of the case above is this house believes that human right threatens local norm.

Table 2: The Second Participant' Emerging CT Skills

No.	Fundamental CT	Example
1	Reasons and Conclusions	Because, if we can do anything that we want, the other people would not always fine about it. Therefore, their satisfactions are arbitrary and temporary. And in the end of the day they just want more.
2	Clarify and	Human right can be anything.

	Interpret expressions and ideas	people can do anything they want without limitation as long as it satisfies their needs.
3	Evaluate arguments of different kinds	In most European countries or part in united states, people find it normal if they find couples showing affection in the public, like kissing or hugging.
4	Produce explanations	Not find
5	Draw Inferences	However, human right can be really danger if they are allowed to do the thing freely without the consideration to protect other's human feelings, security, comfortability, etc.
6	Produce arguments	Since Indonesian people are still conservative, fundamental, that are very bad, the freedom of opinion itself is also the part of human right. Right? Therefore, the norm itself or local norm itself is meant to protect the union of the people, the citizens then again, it also good a proof that human right can threaten local norm.

The data of the second participant' are taken from the recorded video along debate battle. The recorded video is transcribed in order to make it easier to analyze. The motion of the case above is this house believes that human right threatens local norm.

Table 3: The Third Participant' Emerging CT Skills

No.	Fundamental CT	Example
1	Reasons and Conclusions	And then, there is no doubt to that. So, the human right will make a new rules to block the local norm rules.
2	Clarify and Interpret expressions and ideas	Human right is always what people want but not what people needed.
3	Evaluate arguments of different kinds	Human right is threaten local norm because there are a lot of different between local norm and human right.
4	Produce explanations	Not found
5	Draw Inferences	In every country in this world always campaign about LGBT as the name of human right. And then, there is no doubt to that. ladies and gentlemen human right already campaign about LGBT in every country, every country, every single country

		in this world include Indonesia.
6	Produce arguments	Human right is threaten local norm because there are a lot of different between local norm and human right. Like what I already said, something that a local norm rules but it against human right.

The data of the third participant' are taken from the noted that the participants make in case building section. The motion of the case above is this house believe that human right threaten local norm.

Table 4: The Fourth Participant' Emerging CT Skills

No.	Fundamental CT	Example
1	Reasons and Conclusions	Since majority people in rural area are illiterate that they are easily manipulated, that they are ... Therefore, we should believe what he has taught us.
2	Clarify and Interpret expressions and ideas	For example, the prophet of Muhammad SAW was not living in prosperity.
3	Evaluate arguments of different kinds	In one of those religions, there should be lessons that are being taught in that particular religions.
4	Produce explanations	Not found
5	Draw Inferences	They should have just been the one who spreads about the lessons without expecting any financial feedback, or they should matter about their prosperity. Even, for example the prophet of Muhammad SAW was not living in prosperity.
6	Produce arguments	I want to point out about the government team they mentioned that the certificate is related to the prosperity of the preachers and that it is correlated with their job

The data of the fourth participant' are taken from the noted that the participants make in case building section. The motion of the case above was this house support preacher certification.

4 CONCLUSIONS

The result showed six from nine kinds of fundamental CT skills emerged in the EFL students joining English debates. They are (1) reasons and conclusions, (2) clarify

and interpret expressions and ideas, (3) evaluate arguments of different kinds, (4) produce explanations, (5) draw Inferences, and (6) produce arguments. Thus, English Debate does promote the emergence of EFL students' fundamental critical thinking. Also, English debate is good to be applied in and out class language learning.

REFERENCES

- Beyer, B. K. (1995). *Critical Thinking*. Phi Delta Kappa Educational Foundation.
- Bonwell, C., & Eison, J. (1991). *Active learning: Creative excitement in the classroom*. Washington, D.C.: Jossey-Bass.
- Butler, H. A. (2012). Halpern Critical Thinking Assesment predicts real-world outcomes of critical thinking. *Applied Cognitive Psychology, 25*(5), 721–729.
- Chen, L. (2017). Understanding critical thinking in Chinese sociocultural contexts: A case study in a Chinese college. *Thinking Skills and Creativity, 24*, 140–151. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2017.02.015>
- Danaye Tous, M., Tahriri, A., & Haghighi, S. (2015). The effect of instructing critical thinking through debate on the EFL learners' reading comprehension. *Journal of the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning, 15*(4), 21. <https://doi.org/10.14434/josotl.v15i4.13191>
- Facione, P. A., & others. (2011). Critical thinking: What it is and why it counts. *Insight Assessment, 2007*(1), 1–23.
- Fisher, A. (2001). *Critical Thinking: An Introduction* (Second Edition). Cambridge University Press.
- Freeley, A., & Steinberg, D. (2005). *Argumentation and debate: Critical thinking for reasoned decision making*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.
- Goodwin, J. (2003). Students' perspectives on debate exercises in content area classes. *Communication Education, 52*(2), 157–163.
- Halpern, D. F. (2003). *Thought and Knowledge: An introduction to critical thinking*. Mahwah, NJ: Psychology Press.
- Junining, E. (2016). Developing Critical Thinking Skills in Language Teaching: Oral Interpretation Class. In *Proceeding of International Conference on Teacher Training and Education* (Vol. 1).
- Krieger, D. (2007). Teaching Debate to ESL Students: A Six-Class Unit. *The Internet TESL Journal*.
- Liu, O. L., Frankel, L., & Roohr, K. C. (2014). Assessing Critical Thinking in Higher Education: Current State and Directions for Next-Generation Assessment: Assessing Critical Thinking in Higher Education. *ETS Research Report Series, 2014*(1), 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ets2.12009>

CONAPLIN 10 and ELT TECH 2
"Literacy and Technology in Language Pedagogy and Use"

- Norris, S. P., & Ennis, R. H. (1989). What is critical thinking. *The Practitioner's Guide to Teaching Thinking Series: Evaluating Critical Thinking*, 1-26.
- Oros, A. L. (2007). Let's Debate: Active Learning Encourages Student Participation and Critical Thinking. *Journal of Political Science Education*, 3(3), 293-311. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15512160701558273>
- Quinn, S. (2005). *Debating*. Brisbane: Act. Retrieved from <http://www.learndebating.com/english/DEBATING.pdf>
- Rashtchi, M., & Sadraeimanesh, F. (2011). Is Debate a Useful Strategy in Enhancing the Reading Comprehension and Critical Thinking of Iranian EFL Learners? *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 1(4), 361-369. <https://doi.org/10.4304/tpls.1.4.361-369>
- Stapleton, P. (2001). Assessing Critical Thinking in the Writing of Japanese University Students. *SAGE Publications*, 18(4), 506-548.
- Willingham, D. (2007). Critical Thinking: Why is it so hard to teach? *American Educator*, 8-19.

Promoting the Emergence of EFL Students' Fundamental Critical Thinking Skills through English Debate: A Case Study in Indonesian Context

ORIGINALITY REPORT

12%
SIMILARITY INDEX

12%
INTERNET SOURCES

0%
PUBLICATIONS

0%
STUDENT PAPERS

MATCH ALL SOURCES (ONLY SELECTED SOURCE PRINTED)

12%
★ **sportdocbox.com**
Internet Source

Exclude quotes Off
Exclude bibliography Off

Exclude matches Off